



Detective Formula in Agatha Christie's *The Murder at The Vicarage* and Chandra Bientang Anggarie's *Dua Dini Hari* Novels

Baiq Jasnieta Anjani Putri¹, Andang Saehu², Pepen Priyawan³

¹²³ Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung

anjaniputri1443@gmail.com

Abstract

This study analyzes the detective story formula in *The Murder at The Vicarage* by Agatha Christie and *Dua Dini Hari* by Chandra Bientang Anggarie using John G. Cawelti's theory and a comparative literature approach. The data in this study consists of words, phrases, clauses, and sentences found in both novels and were analyzed using Miles, Huberman, and Saldana's data analysis techniques. The findings show that both novels apply Cawelti's major detective patterns: situation, pattern of action, characters and relationships, and setting. However, the novels differ in their application of the formula. The differences can be seen in the portrayal of the detective, investigation process, narrative atmosphere, and social setting. *The Murder at The Vicarage* represents the classical detective formula by emphasizing logical investigation and the restoration of social order. Meanwhile, *Dua Dini Hari* represents the hard-boiled detective formula by focusing on violence, corruption, and the detective's struggle against harsh social realities. This study also demonstrates that Cawelti's detective formula remains relevant in contemporary detective fiction, as its fundamental patterns are still applied in modern works such as *Dua Dini Hari*, although adapted to contemporary social realities.

Keywords: Detective formula, comparative literature, classical detective, hard-boiled detective

1. INTRODUCTION

Crime fiction or detective fiction is a genre of popular fiction that deals with the investigation of crimes, the depiction of those crimes and the motives behind them, as well as the world of criminals, investigators (detectives) and criminal police. Literary works can be categorized as crime fiction if they contain mysteries that are usually solved by the protagonist. It can also be seen from the characters that commonly appear, such as detectives, private investigators, criminals, doctors, and journalists (Balogh, 2022).

The detective genre originated from the mystery genre and later became a separate genre due to its distinctive characteristics (Putri & Indriyani, 2024). This genre has become one of the most popular and influential genres in the development of world of literature. The success of this genre lies in its distinctive narrative pattern, which combines the intelligence of the detective character, the presentation of structured clues, and a satisfying resolution of the case. In the history of detective literature, Agatha Christie is known as one of the leading authors with various works that define the standard formula for detective narratives, one of which is the novel *The Murder at The Vicarage*. Meanwhile, in the context of contemporary Indonesian literature, Chandra Bientang Anggarie has emerged as a writer who attempts to adapt and develop the detective story formula through her novel *Dua Dini Hari*. These two novels represent two different literary traditions, in terms of culture, language, and storytelling style, but they share similarities in their use of the detective formula as the main narrative framework.

The detective story formula can also be interpreted as a conventional way of defining or developing certain situations, patterns of action or development of these situations, certain characters and their relationships with one another, as well as the setting or type of setting that suits these characters and actions. This formula was first introduced by Edgar Allan Poe in 1841. It was then popularized by Arthur Conan Doyle in his Sherlock Holmes stories. This formula is still used as a reference by many detective story writers, including Agatha Christie (Cawelti, 1976).

Agatha Christie's novel *The Murder at The Vicarage* was obtained for this study by buying it from the online bookstore in its English edition to ensure the authenticity of the text being analyzed. This novel comes in a collection of novels in title *Agatha Christie's Detectives: Five Complete Novels* which published by Avenel Books, USA, in 1982, and tells the story of an investigation into the death of Colonel Protheroe, who is found murdered in the vicar's study. Meanwhile, the novel *Dua Dini Hari* by Chandra Bientang Anggarie, first published in 2019, was obtained through purchase at an online bookstore in its official print of republish edition in 2024, as a representation of contemporary Indonesian detective literature. These works were chosen because

both clearly use the detective formula as the core of the narrative, but in different cultural and linguistic contexts. Therefore, this study can examine the dynamics of the application of detective formula across cultures and literary traditions.

The detective story formula in the two novels in this study is analyzed using a comparative literature approach. Sapardi Djoko Damono, in his book entitled *Sastra Bandingan* (Comparative Literature), reveals that comparative literature is an approach that does not produce theory, meaning that any theory can be used in this approach. In comparative literature, the method of comparison is paramount. Therefore, the researcher compares these two novels to analyze how detective story formula is applied in each novel. This comparison is important for understanding the stability and adaptability of the detective formula in detective fiction. It also shows how a universal narrative structure can be reshaped by different cultural backgrounds (Damono, 2009).

Research on detective story formula has previously been conducted by several researchers, such as in a study titled *Formula Detektif Klasik pada Cerita Anak The Secret Seven-Sapta Siaga: Kajian Formula Jhon G. Cawelti*. The results of this study show that these storybooks were written using classical detective typology by presenting a hero to achieve the ultimate goal. There are six main phases in the formulaic structure of the story: introduction of the detective, crime and clues, investigation, announcement of the solution, explanation of the solution, and the end of the story. This study also discusses the invention in the story which is the development of the detective genre in the form of attempted theft (Putri & Indriyani, 2024).

Another study related to detective story formula was conducted by Ramos (2021) in the article *The Classical Detective Story Formula from Literature to Videogames*. The study analyzes the adaptation of classical detective formula into video games, particularly *Return of the Obra Dinn*. The findings show that, although players take an active role in solving the mystery, video games still maintain Cawelti's fundamental detective formula, including situation, pattern of action, characters, and setting. The study also highlights the flexibility of detective story formula across different media.

Furthermore, research related to comparative literature in novels has also been conducted by previous researchers, such as in the research conducted by Mustolih and Ningrum in their study, entitled *The Comparative Literature Analysis of Collin's Novel "The Hunger Games" and Veronica Roth's Novel "Divergent"*, which discusses the comparison of feminist values in the main characters in both novels. The results of this study show that the characters in both novels are tough and dominant. Both also engage in activities that refer to the feminist movement. In addition, both fight against injustice in their social environment (Amirrudin et al., 2022).

From the description of previous studies above, there are similarities and differences between previous studies and the latest study. The most obvious similarities are the use of detective story formula and comparative literary analysis. However, studies comparing local and foreign detective fiction through a comparative literature approach are still limited. This gap demonstrates the need for further comparative studies on local and foreign detective fiction. In line with that, the purpose of this study is to analyze how detective story formula is applied in Agatha Christie's novel *The Murder at The Vicarage* and Chandra Bientang Anggarie's novel *Dua Dini Hari* because of their contrasting cultural backgrounds. The researcher also ensured the originality of this research by cross-checking journal websites such as Google Scholar and Garuda.

2. METHOD

This study employed a descriptive qualitative research using a comparative literature approach. Comparative literature compares two or more literary works from different cultural backgrounds, languages, or contexts to identify thematic, structural, and aesthetic similarities. According to Damono (2009), comparative literature is a cross-cultural study that not only compares the content of literary works but also considers the social, historical, and cultural aspects of each work. This approach was chosen because the objects of study come from two different cultural backgrounds, the novel *The Murder at The Vicarage* by Agatha Christie (English) and *Dua Dini Hari* by Chandra Bientang Anggarie (Indonesia). With this approach, the study aims to reveal the application of detective story formula in the two works.

The data in this study consists of words, phrases, clauses, or sentences found in the two novels that were analyzed, *The Murder at The Vicarage* by Agatha Christie and *Dua Dini Hari* by Chandra Bientang Anggarie. These two works are the main sources of the analysis using the established approach and methods.

This research also used the data analysis technique proposed by Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña. In the book *Metodologi Penelitian: Pendekatan Multidisipliner*, this technique consists of four flows: data collection, data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing/verifying. Data collection refers to gathering the data that indicate the elements of detective story formula. The collected data are then condensed through selecting, simplifying, and grouping based on Cawelti's detective story formula, including situation, pattern of action, characters and relationships, and setting. The grouped data are subsequently paraphrased and interpreted to explain the application of detective story formula in both novels. Furthermore, data display presents the findings systematically to facilitate comparison between the two novels, while conclusion drawing/verifying is conducted

to identify the similarities and differences in the applications of detective story formula in both novels. These processes are interconnected and may occur simultaneously throughout the research process (Citradin, 2020).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

This section discusses the detective story formula found in *The Murder at the Vicarage* by Agatha Christie and *Dua Dini Hari* by Chandra Anggarie using John G. Cawelti's theory of detective story formula. According to Cawelti, detective stories generally consist of four major patterns related to narrative elements, namely situation, pattern of action, characters and relationships, and setting (Cawelti, 1976). Through these aspects, this discussion examines how *The Murder at the Vicarage* reflects the classical detective formula, while *Dua Dini Hari* reflects the hard-boiled detective formula.

Situation

John G. Cawelti in his book stated that classical detective stories are composed of four main patterns related to narrative elements, including plot, structure, character, and setting. The first pattern is the situation. He explained that the situation must begin with an "unsolved crime" that leads to an investigation to solve the mystery. The crime that occurs must also be proportional to the series of mystifications and investigations (Cawelti, 1976, p. 80).

In Agatha Christie's novel *The Murder at The Vicarage*, Colonel Protheroe is found murdered in the vicarage by Leonard Clement, the narrator and the clergyman residing there. Initial findings such as the time of death, the weapon used, the time on the clock that fell from the desk when the Colonel was killed, and the note the victim intended to write with a timestamp, left many questions in everyone's minds, including Miss Marple's (Christie, 1982, p. 25–29). Who was the perpetrator? What was the motive? And what was Colonel Protheroe actually trying to convey in his note?

Almost all the residents of St. Mary Mead disliked Colonel Protheroe's attitudes and even openly expressed the excitement of world would be better without him. Based on this, Miss Marple, the detective, ended up noting down 7 names of people who might be involved in Colonel Protheroe's murder (Christie, 1982, p. 47). The case almost reached a breakthrough when the person suspected by the police confessed and surrendered, but it dimmed again due to the confessions of the second and third person.

In line with Christie's novel, the situation in *Dua Dini Hari* is depicted with the discovery of three murder victims "*tiga bocah kelabu tergantung di tiang penyangga jalan layang*," (Anggarie, 2024, p. 7) followed by the discovery of a fourth body that shocked the community and raised similar questions: who is the perpetrator, what is the motive, and where did the murder take place? Based on the initial investigation, the four victims had no identities and no one recognized them. They were all displayed in public places, although each victim was killed in a different way. The four of them are also estimated to have been killed at almost the same time, which is in the early morning "*Selewat tengah malam. Antara jam dua sampai jam empat*." (Anggarie, 2024, p. 36). However, while *The Murder at The Vicarage* focuses on the detective's efforts to find and uphold justice, *Dua Dini Hari*, on the other hand, centers on the detective's struggle against threats and terror in his efforts to uphold that justice (Cawelti, 1976, p. 142).

Pattern of Action

The second pattern is the pattern of action which describes a sequence of events in six phases, including: a) the introduction of the detective, b) crime and clues, c) investigations, d) announcement of the solution, e) explanation of the solution, f) and denouement. Each phase has a distinct purpose in leading the narrative from the beginning of the mystery to its resolution. Cawelti also notes that "These parts do not always appear in sequence" (Cawelti, 1976), which means that depending on the author's narrative style, the arrangement may change, overlap, or even merge with one another. In some cases, for instance, the explanation of the solution may be partially revealed before the formal publication. These phases are still necessary since they offer a structural framework that organizes the plot, maintains the tension, and ensures the reader can follow and understand the story as a coherent whole.

a. Introduction of The Detective

The overall narrative structure of *The Murder at The Vicarage* follows the sequence of patterns in the formula mentioned by Cawelti in his book. The story begins with the introduction of the detective through the narrator's and other characters' perspectives on Miss Marple's abilities as an amateur detective. She is depicted as an omniscient figure who consistently draws conclusions that prove to be correct. Despite her frail physical appearance, her eye for detail is unmatched in St. Mary Mead, a skill bolstered by her hobbies of gardening and birdwatching with binoculars, as seen during the tea party at the Vicarage (Ketović & Juraj, 2019). Consequently, it is no surprise that the residents of St. Mary Mead consider Miss Marple's words to be invariably true (Christie, 1982, p. 11–13). Cawelti also explains that this kind of introduction establishes the detective's capabilities as a

hero, assuring the reader that no matter how complex the problem, the hero will ultimately solve it (Cawelti, 1976, p. 82).

In contrast to the pattern found in *The Murder at The Vicarage* which introduces the detective before the crime occurs, *Dua Dini Hari* presents the crime first, preceding the introduction of its protagonist. Cawelti notes two distinct methods for introducing a detective: either by directly demonstrating their unique capabilities or by depicting their domestic life. The former method is adopted in *The Murder at The Vicarage*, whereas the latter is used in *Dua Dini Hari* to introduce one of its sleuths. *Dua Dini Hari* features two detectives, each introduced through a different approach (Cawelti, 1976, p. 82).

Through a third-person perspective, the reader is initially introduced to a woman in her twenties whose life is far from comfortable. Unlike Holmes and Watson's luxurious apartment or the peaceful upper-class village life in *The Murder at The Vicarage*, Kanti lives in a dusty boarding house with damp and crumbling walls in Jatinegara. This setting immediately reflects the harsh social reality surrounding her life. The introduction of Kanti as a primary character is given its own dedicated space, where Anggarie focuses solely on describing her circumstances. Her eventual involvement with Elang in the murder investigation is revealed incrementally through her daily routines (Anggarie, 2024, p. 15–25; Cawelti, 1976, p. 144).

Next, the story moves to the introduction of the second central character, Elang. He is depicted at the police station, reacting to the news of the discovery of a fourth body, an event presented at the very beginning of the narrative. Elang is described as a man of Kanti's age with a stubborn yet confident personality. Regardless of how many people doubt his abilities, he persists in pursuing his goals. Although he is not a member of the police force, he is constantly present in that environment and frequently observes how the police handle reports. Nevertheless, Elang gives the reader the impression that he does not particularly like the way the police operate. He believes the officers are slow and incompetent, as they respond slowly to the murder cases. Furthermore, this introduction of Elang simultaneously provides the reader with information regarding initial clues to the crimes (Anggarie, 2024, p. 26–27).

This type of introduction aligns with Cawelti's (1976, p. 144) explanation of the hard-boiled detective, noting that the detective is sometimes portrayed as being already at the scene of the crime. The different methods used to introduce the two detectives in *Dua Dini Hari* clearly show that Anggarie aims to portray detectives in a more realistic way. These detectives may experience feelings of marginalization, see themselves as different from those around them, and often be underestimated, characteristics that sharply contrast with the traditional portrayal of the classical detective.

b. Crime and Clues

The presentation of the crime and clues in *The Murder at The Vicarage* occurs after the detective's introduction. This aligns with Cawelti's statement that the crime is typically narrated directly after the detective is introduced. However, the sequence within the pattern of action in *Dua Dini Hari* is equally valid, even though the crime and initial clues are presented at the very beginning before the introduction of the detective. This is because, as Cawelti stated, the sequence of the pattern of action is not absolute (Cawelti, 1976, p. 84).

In *The Murder at The Vicarage*, Colonel Protheroe is found murdered inside the vicarage with initial clues that serve to guide the direction of the investigation. He was killed in the late afternoon between approximately 6:20 and 6:35 PM by a gunshot wound to the head from a small-caliber pistol, a .25 Mauser. Additionally, a clock on the writing desk in the vicarage had fallen over and showed the time as 6:22. An unfinished note was also discovered, timestamped at 6:20. No one knew the identity of the perpetrator because the house was empty at the time. Clement claimed to have received a suspicious phone call that made him leave the vicarage. Consequently, only Mary, the maid, was present, and she claimed not to have heard any gunshots (Christie, 1982, p. 25–29).

These initial findings actually lead us to suspect Lawrence Redding, based on the fact that he owned the weapon and had a potential motive (Christie, 1982, p. 26). However, the act of turning himself in to the police station led many, including Miss Marple, to believe that he was not the culprit. Mary's testimony also stated that Redding was only at the vicarage for a few minutes—a window of time that would have been insufficient to carry out the murder. This is further complicated by the fact that the vicarage clock was always set fifteen minutes faster (Christie, 1982, p. 31–34). These clues encourage further investigation to determine who the actual perpetrator is, and whether these clues merely function red herrings.

On the other hand, information about the crime in *Dua Dini Hari* is presented in two ways, through a newspaper and the execution of the fourth victim. Anggarie creates a suspenseful atmosphere by depicting the execution of the fourth victim in detail. At the same time, this scene provides readers with several initial clues. Other clues regarding the deaths of the four victims are explained further in the section introducing Elang as an amateur detective. In this section, it is revealed that the four victims are most likely street children because none of them have any identity and no one knows them. The four victims were also displayed in public and were all killed in the early morning, with only the cause of death being different (Anggarie, 2024, p. 31).

Without any evidence or eyewitnesses, it will be very difficult to determine the next steps in the investigation. Including determining the possible suspects, especially in areas like Jatinegara where crimes can happen anywhere, anytime, to anyone, that is the bitter reality. However, the crime targeting street children was carried out with careful and organized planning. By displaying the victim to the public, it is clear that this is not just an ordinary murder; there is a purpose and motive behind it. Anggarie successfully portrayed the dark side of the city that targets marginalized people in life. This condition forces Elang to determine his first step with the case. As a result, a stark contrast emerges between the decision-making regarding the detective's involvement with crime in classic and hard-boiled detective stories. In classical detective stories, the involvement is based on restoring social conditions to their original order, whereas in hard-boiled stories, it is based on the detective's moral and emotional state (Cawelti, 1976, p. 81 & 143).

c. Investigation

The investigation in detective fiction function as the process through which the detective sorts clues, testimonies, gradually uncovers the hidden truth behind the crime. In classical detective fiction, the investigation generally emphasizes rational analysis and logical deduction, whereas in hard-boiled detective fiction, the investigation often places the detective in dangerous physical and emotional situations.

This part in *The Murder at The Vicarage* is formed through a series of witnesses, suspects, and false solutions that result in numerous testimonies and alibis that feel mismatched or overlapping. Miss Marple must first be able to sort through the pile of clues to determine which ones point to the actual perpetrator. Thus, the investigation in this Christie's novel is a logical process to test the validity of the alibi; the detective only needs to solve the murder puzzle created by the perpetrator. In the process, passing through various possible suspects until finally focusing on the least-likely person, Christie is seen several times using red herrings to mislead the readers, such as Mrs. Lestrangle and Hawes as suspects, the time of death and the time of the shooting, as well as a fake letter with a timestamp. Christie even makes the perpetrators appear to have successfully deceived the detective with their role in the story (Cawelti, 1976, p. 85; Christie, 1982).

By comparison, in *Dua Dini Hari*, the investigation is not just about determining who the guilty party is, but rather about determining the detective's own moral position like Elang who is trying to uncover the case of the street children's murder. In his investigation, Rudi (Elang's childhood friend) was mysteriously murdered. Then Elang himself almost lost his life because he was buried alive. He also had to face the fact that his parents were hiding important clues related to the case. In the course of his investigation, the murders targeting street children continued to occur. Besides Elang, Kanti also experienced the same thing, her curiosity led her to terror. She found a shoebox containing a dead black chicken with its blood still fresh. Until the fact that the strange events she experienced were related to the case of the street children's murder. Kanti even experienced violence and confinement by the murderers and witnessed firsthand how the street children met their end. Such events are what hard-boiled detectives must face, they have to decide whether to continue the mission or stop altogether (Cawelti, 1976, p. 143; Christie, 1982).

The investigation in *The Murder at The Vicarage* progresses rapidly and produces numerous clues that continuously shift the atmosphere of the story. Although it cannot be denied that the abundance of clues also becomes an obstacle. However, the detective will once again return with a breath of fresh air for the progress of the case by solving the puzzle of the clues. Meanwhile, in *Dua Dini Hari*, the investigation seems to progress more slowly due to the absence of clues directly pointing to the perpetrator. The detectives in Anggarie's novel, have to crawl more slowly than in Christie's novel. Elang and Kanti even investigated each other before the Kanti terror case ultimately brought them together, revealing that their investigations were interconnected. They also found themselves repeatedly in unfavourable situations, even tending to be detrimental. The focus of the story is more on what is experienced and how the detective makes subsequent decisions. It is perfectly acceptable to refer to *The Murder at The Vicarage* as a cozy mystery while *Dua Dini Hari* is referred to as hard-boiled.

d. Announcement of Solution

Announcement of solution is the phase in which detective begins to reveal the mystery by connecting the clues. This part in *The Murder at The Vicarage* has its own place in the final part of chapter twenty-nine until near the middle of the next chapter. For a moment at the beginning of this chapter, Christie plays with the readers by presenting a false solution that there is a third party who claims to be Colonel's murderer. This solution even seems so convincing with evidence that has not been revealed until now. However, at the moment when the investigators were engulfed in confusion, Miss Marple then stepped in to explain that the perpetrator wanted everyone to think exactly what they were thinking at that moment. Miss Marple did not immediately mention the

name of the perpetrator but instead tried to clear Hawes' name first, and only after she mentioned that the real perpetrator was Lawrence Redding (Christie, 1982, p. 151–152).

Cawelti says that the announcement of the solution does not always directly lead to the discovery of the perpetrator, as in Christie's novel where this part does not directly lead them to the arrest of Lawrence Redding and Anne Protheroe. Instead, it is an explanation of the puzzle from the clues that had previously confused everyone. In Christie's novel, this section ends with an explanation of the seven suspects who were previously suspected by Miss Marple. Thus, we conclude that the puzzle pieces fit increasingly well here (Cawelti, 1976, p. 87; Christie, 1982 p. 152-153).

On the other hand, in *Dua Dini Hari*, the announcement of the solution emerges through a direct confrontation between Elang and Kanti with the actual perpetrators. Elang learns who the perpetrators are, the actual execution site, and their motives for killing the children through the confession of the perpetrators. Similarly, Kanti witnesses the execution process by the other perpetrators herself. In the hard-boiled formula, the announcement of the solution and the explanation of the solution are sometimes not always complete and are mixed with action or violence. These two elements also appear to be intertwined, making their division not as clear as it seems in Christie's novels (Anggarie, 2024, p. 161–177).

e. Explanation of Solution

In *The Murder at The Vicarage*, this part is a continuation of the solution announcement previously made by Miss Marple, which contains the detective's explanation of how and why the crime was committed. Miss Marple successfully placed all the clues and evidence and then explained how the murder occurred in chronological sequence, making everyone present unable to deny that it was truly logical and strong. That Colonel Protheroe's murder had actually been meticulously planned by Lawrence, with Anne also going along with it. When Lawrence managed to deceive everyone and evade suspicion, he continued his act and tried to eliminate evidence that could incriminate Anne by pretending to assist in the investigation. Until finally he knew to whom the Colonel's letter was addressed, he immediately used it to become the scapegoat for his crime. However, with the detective's abilities, no matter how difficult the puzzle is, it will still be solved (Christie, 1982, p. 153–156).

Christie have succeeded in keeping readers focused on the investigation conducted by Miss Marple, while still distancing them from her thoughts. This is what sets it apart from the formula applied by Anggarie, which instead involves the reader in everything experienced and thought by both detectives in the murder case. In *Dua Dini Hari*, the announcement of the solution is not obtained by the reader through the detective's direct explanation but rather from what he experiences. This explanation is divided into several stages. First, the explanation is taken when the frame shifts to Kanti regarding who was involved, how the execution was carried out, and where the bodies were stored before being buried. Second, the explanation obtained by Elang regarding the motive of one of the perpetrators who confronted him when he was in a different location from Kanti. Third, the explanation is revealed through Bripka Ranggalawe's flashback about events that occurred three years earlier. The flashback reveals how high-ranking police officers violated the law because they believed their actions could solve one of the city's social problems. From here, we know that Bripka Ranggalawe was the one who deliberately showcased the victims actually killed by the perpetrators, with the aim of making everyone aware that the street children were being hunted to be "eliminated" (Anggarie, 2024, p. 161–186).

The explanation of the solution becomes important in a detective story because it provides validity that will complement the investigative part, while also measuring the extent of the reader's ability to guess the murder puzzle (Cawelti, 1976, p. 88).

f. Denouement

The denouement in *The Murder at The Vicarage* serve more as corroboration of the detective's solution (Cawelti, 1976, p. 91). In this part, Miss Marple successfully proves that her deduction is correct with her plan to trap Lawrence Redding. Then, indeed, he does something "foolish" that makes all the problems clear and the fact that Miss Marple is right in every way. However, the proof of Lawrence and Anne's guilt is only briefly mentioned so that the criminal does not take over the "stage" of the detective. The main focus in this part is not on the physical act of arrest or the detailed legal process, but rather on the isolation of guilt from the couple in order to restore social order in St. Mary Mead. With the revelation of the perpetrator, the "swamp of evidence" that had previously enveloped the villagers, such as the mystery of Mrs. Lestranger, is finally lifted, and the story ends with the victory of amateur detective logic that successfully restores peace in the isolated environment (Christie, 1982, p. 156–161).

Furthermore, the denouement is always related to the confession of the crime by the perpetrator. In *Dua Dini Hari*, this confession is revealed at the same time as the perpetrator is revealed. Cawelti (1976, p. 90) also mentions that "Sometimes denouement and solution are combined," so it can be concluded that the denouement

in *Dua Dini Hari* is combined in solution and explanation. Furthermore, unlike Christie's novel which ends with the restoration of social order, the denouement in Anggarie's novel presents an antithesis to the classical detective formula. The characteristics of hard-boiled detectives, the resolution of this story does not provide intellectual satisfaction, but rather reveals a social reality endemic with corruption (Cresci, 2019). The success of Elang and Kanti in identifying the perpetrator of the street child's murder did not lead to the criminal's arrest by the legal authorities, but rather to the self-destruction of the detective. The arson of Elang's house, which kills him and his family, demonstrates the brutality of the corrupt system. At the same time, the institutional attempt to silence Kanti by placing her in a mental hospital shows that truth becomes a threat to those in power. Thus, the denouement in *Dua Dini Hari* emphasizes that the crime here is no longer the act of an individual but has become part of a corrupt system (Anggarie, 2024).

Characters and Relationship

The third pattern is characters and relationships. Whether it's the classic formula or the hard-boiled one, both develop four main character roles: the victim, the criminal, the detective, and those who are threatened by the crime but incapable of solving it. All of them appear as explained below.

a. The Victim

Christie in *The Murder at The Vicarage* maintains an emotional distance from the victim by making him an unpopular figure among the residents of St. Mary Mead. The victim in classic stories receives very little stage time, and sometimes the information obtained about them comes only from the accounts of other characters. This aims to prevent readers from feeling too mournful over the victim's death; instead, classic stories emphasize the mystery surrounding the victim's death rather than the fate of the death itself. Like in the murder of Protheroe, which left several clues that were later found to be false clues (Cawelti, 1976, p. 91).

On the other hand, the story of *Dua Dini Hari* tends to encourage readers to feel a strong attachment to the crime. Often in hard-boiled stories, the initial victim is a friend of the detective or another victim whose death is regrettable. *Dua Dini Hari* uses both methods by presenting the death of Rudi, who is Elang's friend, and the deaths of street children to show us that regardless of who the victim is, death remains death and the murderer must be brought to justice. The presentation of the victims in this novel very much represents the multiplicity of victims mentioned by Cawelti in his book (Cawelti, 1976, p. 147).

b. The Criminal

The criminals in *The Murder at The Vicarage*, namely Lawrence Redding and Anne Protheroe, are a perfect representation of the classical detective formula described by Cawelti (Cawelti, 1976, p. 148) as figures hiding behind the "veil of mysterious clues." As the perpetrators, they play the role of the least-likely person because Redding is deliberately portrayed as a sympathetic character with a strong romantic involvement, a position that in the classical tradition would usually be proven innocent by the end of the story. Unlike the criminals in hard-boiled stories, they are solitary individuals with rational and specific motives who act without the aid of large criminal organizations. The main focus of the story remains on how Miss Marple uncovers their hidden identities through the process of intellectual rationalization, without giving these criminals room to "steal the show" through punishment drama or excessive physical brutality.

On the contrary, the criminals in *Dua Dini Hari* represent a hard-boiled pattern that is the antithesis of the classic formula because they play much more complex, ambiguous, and dominant roles. The perpetrators directly involved in the murder of these street children are individuals with different criminal records from one another. According to Cawelti's theory, the criminals in this narrative are figures who have connections with larger criminal organizations or corrupt power systems. In *Dua Dini Hari*, those individuals are asked by high-ranking police officials to atone for their crimes by committing more crimes, eliminating the street children who are a problem in the city. The crimes are not portrayed as a temporary disturbances to the peaceful social order like in St. Mary Mead, but rather a manifestation of crime that has become endemic or ingrained in society. If classic criminals eventually submit to the law, the criminals in *Dua Dini Hari* instead use their systemic power to turn the tables, where they are able to commit heinous acts such as the elimination of witnesses, Elang and his family, and manipulation of legal institutions to silence Kanti as the truth-teller (Anggarie, 2024, p. 178–181; Cawelti, 1976, p. 148).

c. The Detective

In *The Murder at The Vicarage*, the detective is portrayed as someone who relies on intelligence, observation, and a deep understanding of human nature to solve the case. Unlike hard-boiled detectives who actively pursue or use physical strength, Miss Marple appears as an ordinary old woman who looks simple, calm, and unassuming. However, behind her appearance, she possesses the ability to observe the behaviours, habits, and speech of others very meticulously. Miss Marple believes that human nature tends to have the same patterns

everywhere, so she often understands the characters of the suspects by comparing them to people she has met in the village. This depiction shows that the main strength of the classical detective lies in the ability to think logically and read human psychology, rather than in action. In addition, Miss Marple is also depicted as a patient person who does not rush to conclusions. She gathers various small details that seem unimportant to others, then connects them rationally until she finally uncovers the truth. Thus, Christie portrays Miss Marple as a classical detective who uses classical reasoning and sharp observation as the main tools of investigation.

Unlike classical detectives who rely more on logical reasoning from a safe distance, Elang and Kanti in *Dua Dini Hari* actively operate in the field and must confront threats, violence, and various harsh social realities. They are also depicted as having a tough, realistic, and even pessimistic personality toward society because they see the world as a place full of lies and crimes (Cresci, 2019). They are depicted as working in a world that has been chaotic from the beginning, including the murder of street children that has been ongoing for three years, so the resolution of the story does not lead us to a truly neat or harmonious ending.

d. *Those Who are Threatened by The Crime but Incapable of Solving It*

Roles outside of the three previously discussed play different functions between the classic and hard-boiled formulas. In *The Murder at The Vicarage*, as a classic story, these roles largely function as suspects who are ultimately exonerated when the real criminal is revealed. Whereas in hard-boiled stories, these roles are divided into groups, those who are on the detective's side or those who oppose him. The first are the characters who play the role of friends or allies to the detective. In *Dua Dini Hari*, these characters are the ones who provide at least some useful information and advice in the investigation. Like his father and Maudy, who help Elang by providing information from their workplace, the police station. Although individual police officers may befriend detectives, the police as an institution are depicted as incapable of handling rampant crime, because the law is too decadent to deliver real justice. Other minor characters play the role of adversaries to the detective, but such characters are not found in *Dua Dini Hari*. Characters with such roles are actually taken on by the criminals in the story of Anggarie (Cawelti, 1976, p. 153).

Setting

The last pattern of Cawelti's detective formula is Setting. In *The Murder at The Vicarage*, the setting used is an isolated and enclosed environment, namely the village of St. Mary Mead. In line with the classical detective pattern, this village represents the order and harmony of the middle-class social structure disrupted by the anomaly of crime. Cawelti explains that such a setting deliberately abstracts the story from the complexities of the outside world to remain focused on limited clues and suspects. By limiting the movement space to the vicarage and its surroundings, this setting provides a logical reason for the detective to avoid broader social injustice issues, so that the resolution of the case at the end of the story can fully restore peace and prove that the society is fundamentally good (Cawelti, 1976, p. 97-98).

On the other hand, the setting in *Dua Dini Hari* follows the characteristics of the hard-boiled formula, which uses a modern city as the background, namely Jatinegara. This city is depicted as only creates a sense of tranquility at night, because city life begins in the morning. The hustle and bustle of people heading to work, the sound of honking vehicles echoing, and other noises that occur when city life begins. Jatinegara in this novel also reflects Cawelti's notion of a decadent city, a region where the law is no longer able to contend with deeply entrenched networks of interest, thus turning every corner into a real threat for the detective.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis of *The Murder at The Vicarage* and *Dua Dini Hari*, this study concludes that both novels adapted the detective story formula in different forms, including the classical detective formula and the hard-boiled detective formula. Both novels applied the four major patterns proposed by John G. Cawelti, which are situation, pattern of action, characters and relationships, and setting. Nevertheless, the implementation of these patterns differs significantly in each novel.

The Murder at The Vicarage, as a representation of classical detective fiction, emphasizes intellectual investigation, logical reasoning, and the detective's ability to solve the mystery systematically. The story presents a neat and satisfying resolution in which social order is restored after the criminal is revealed. Conversely, *Dua Dini Hari*, as a representation of hard-boiled detective fiction, focuses more on the detective's struggle against violence, threats, and systemic corruption. The detectives are portrayed realistically as individuals who must survive in a harsh social environment where justice is difficult to achieve. Consequently, the resolution in *Dua Dini Hari* does not restore social order, but instead exposes the existence of corruption and moral decay within society.

Therefore, this study shows that although both novels share the same structural detective formula, differences in cultural background, narrative style, and literary tradition influence the way the formula is developed and

present. The comparison also demonstrates that detective fiction is a flexible genre that can adapt to different social and cultural contexts while still maintaining its essential narrative structure.

REFERENCE

- Aidin, A. H., Rasiah, & Gultom, E. S. (2023). FORMULA OF CLASSICAL DETECTIVE IN KNIVES OUT MOVIE DIRECTED BY RIAN JOHNSON. *Southeast Journal of Language and Literary Studies*, 3(2), 131–146.
- Amirrudin, Mustolih, A., & Ningrum, C. M. (2022). The Comparative Literature Analysis of Collins' Novel "The Hunger Games" and Veronica Roth's Novel "Divergent." *ENLIT Journal*, 2(2), 97–109. <https://doi.org/10.33654/enlit.v2i2.1917>
- Anggarie, C. B. (2024). *Dua Dini Hari*. Noura Books Publisher.
- Arifin, F., Merawati, F., & Hanifah, H. N. (2022). FORMULA MISTERI DALAM PERMAINAN JURIT MALAM BUATAN GAMBIR GAME STUDIO KAJIAN GENRE JOHN G. CAWELTI. *Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pembelajarannya*, 5(1).
- Balogh, C. (2022). *COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE GOTHIC AND DETECTIVE LITERARY WORKS BY EDGAR ALLAN POE*. <https://dspace.kmf.uz.ua/jspui/handle/123456789/1717>
- Bassnet, S. (1993). *Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction*. Blackwell Publishers.
- Cawelti, J. G. (1976). *Adventure, Mystery, and Romance: Formula Stories as Art and Popular Culture* (pbk. ed., [Nachdr.]). The Univ. of Chicago Press.
- Christie, A. (1982). The Murder at The Vicarage. In *Agatha Christie's Detectives: Five Complete Novels*. Avenel Books.
- Citradin, Y. (2020). BAB XVI TEKNIK ANALISIS DATA PENELITIAN KUALITATIF DAN PENELITIAN KUANTITATIF. In *Metodologi Penelitian: Pendekatan Multidisipliner* (pp. 201–205). Ideas Publishing.
- Cresci, M. (2019). *The Eternal Detective: Poe's Creative and Resolvent Duality in the*. <https://digitalcommons.montclair.edu/etd/266>
- Damono, S. D. (2009). *Sastra Bandingan*. Editum.
- Jatmiko, D. (2016). ESTETIKA SASTRA POPULER DALAM NOVEL MENCARI SARANG ANGIN KARYA SUPARTO BRATA. *Lakon: Jurnal Kajian Sastra dan Budaya*, 4(1), 24. <https://doi.org/10.20473/lakon.v4i1.1928>
- Ketović, M., & Juraj, J. (2019). *Detective Archetypes in Anglophone Fiction* [University of J.J Strossmayer]. <https://urn.nsk.hr/urn:nbn:hr:142:968848>
- Lontaan, P. K., Mamentu, A. C., & Sabudu, D. (2022). THE DETECTIVE FORMULA IN AGATHA CHRISTIE'S SLEEPING MURDER: MISS MARPLE IN THE LAST CASE. *Journal of Teaching English, Linguistics, and Literature*, 1(3).
- Putri, Y. A., & Indriyani, J. G. (2024). Formula Detektif Klasik pada Cerita Anak The Secret Seven-Sapta Siaga: Kajian Formula John G. Cawelti. *DIDAKTIS: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia*, 2(1), 17–24. <https://doi.org/10.33096/didaktis.v2i1.584>
- Ramos, E. S. (2021). The Classical Detective Story Formula from Literature to Videogames. *Simpósio Brasileiro de Jogos e Entretenimento Digital (SBGames)*, 238–244. https://doi.org/10.5753/sbgames_estendido.2021.19644
- Sabani, I., & Istiani, I. (2024). The Infidelity of Using Detective Story Formula in Enola Holmes Film Adaptation. *Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 16(2). <https://doi.org/10.31294/w.v16i2>
- Sartika, Y. (2022). THE FORMULA OF AGATHA CHRISTIE'S DETECTIVE STORY THE THIRD-FLOOR FLAT. *Journal of English Linguistic and Literature*, 7(2). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.55345/stba1.v7i2.39>
- Shade, L. (2020). Hardboiled vs Classic Detective Fiction. In *Novel Suspects*. <https://www.novelsuspects.com/articles/hardboiled-vs-classic-detective-fiction/>
- Sungkowati, Y. (2014). PENGARUH CERITA DETEKTIF TRADISIONAL BARAT TERHADAP NOVEL INDONESIA MENCARI SARANG ANGIN DAN KREMIL KARYA SUPARTO BRATA. 7(1), 109–122.